

NSW Coastal Panel	MEETING NUMBER: 34
	LOCATION: Teleconference
	DATE: 15 DECEMBER 2016
MINUTES	

Present

Name	Nominating Organisation
Coastal Panel members	
Prof Bruce Thom (BT)	Chair
Dr Carolyn Davies (CD)	Office of Environment and Heritage (Deputy Chair)
A/Prof Ron Cox (RC)	Local Government NSW (LGNSW)
Prof Andrew Short (AS)	Local Government NSW (LGNSW)
Ms Jane Lofthouse (JL)	Local Government NSW (LGNSW)
Mr Stephen Murray (SM)	Department of Planning and Environment
Mr Stephen Wills (SW)	Department of Industry - Lands
Secretariat	
Dr Marc Daley (MD)	Office of Environment and Heritage - Coastal Panel Secretariat
Ms Jane Gibbs (JG)	Office of Environment and Heritage - Coastal Panel Secretariat

Agenda Item 1 – Welcome and Apologies

The Chair opened the meeting at 12.00pm and welcomed Panel members.

Apologies were received from Mr Phil Watson (Secretariat).

Agenda Item 2 – Declaration of Interests

Nil.

Agenda Item 3 – Confirmation of Previous Panel Minutes

The Secretariat advised minutes from meeting 33 were still be drafted and would be circulated prior to the next Panel meeting.

Agenda Item 4 – Matters Arising from Previous Meetings

BT requested an update on the Arrawarra DA and notification on the Panel's determination. MD advised the applicant had been notified of the Panel's determination and the notice of determination has been published on the Panel's webpage.

Agenda Item 5 – Update on Wamberal DA

JG updated the Panel on the status of the Wamberal DA.

Agenda Item 6 – Woolli CZMP

On 13 December 2016, the Chair received correspondence from Minister Stokes requesting the advice of the Panel, regarding the adequacy of the Woolli Coastal Zone Management Plan (CZMP) and its suitability for certification under the Coastal Protection Act 1979.

Following a discussion and consideration of the matter, the Panel instructed MD to prepare a draft response to the Minister for circulation and finalisation by the Panel, encompassing the following elements:

- The documents relied upon to inform the Panel's advice include:
 - (i) Draft Woolli Beach Coastal Zone Management Plan (CZMP) (Version: PA1063, Final, dated November 2016);
 - (ii) OEH Regional Operations Group assessment of draft CZMP against the statutory requirements of the *Coastal Protection Act 1979* and minimum requirements of the *Guidelines for Preparing Coastal Zone Management Plans (2013)*.
- Note that the preparation of a CZMP for this sector of coastline represents a complex task what is perceived to be a high hazard risk associated with the proximity and potential exposure of Woolli Village to the physical coastal, potential and fluvial processes, along with multi-jurisdictional responsibilities which include Council, National Parks and Wildlife Service in relation to Yuraygir National Park, DPI Fisheries in relation to the Solitary Islands Marine Park and Clarence Coast Reserve and the Clarence Coast Regional Crown Reserve.
- Commends Clarence Valley Council for taking a 'soft' approach to management designed around nourishment as an action to 'buy time' and reduce risks to development and assets identified to be at current or future hazard risk.
- Commends Clarence Valley Council for diligently preparing the CZMP in consultation with the community and in partnership with OEH and other Government agencies.
- Note that in the opinion of the Coastal Panel, the draft Woolli Beach CZMP is **currently not suitable for certification** in accordance with provisions of the *Coastal Protection Act 1979*. The key issue of concern within the plan relates to the management of current and projected future risks from coastal hazards to development and assets. The proposed management approach of the Beach Nourishment Scheme (BNS) seeks to remove the risk to built assets by providing a buffer against a 50-year ARI storm event. However, there is significant uncertainty on how successful the BNS will be in achieving the desired 50 year ARI beach erosion hazard reduction objective. Furthermore, there will still remain an "immediate" risk to existing development and infrastructure from an even larger than a 50 year ARI; for example between a 50 year and 100 year ARI event. The minimum assessment criteria in the Guidelines for Preparing CZMP's requires assessment of a 100 year ARI (approximate) beach erosion event to enable the formulation and proposition of actions to manage current and projected future risks from coastal hazards in a CZMP.
- Note that the Plan fails to provide additional detail to inform about a sustainable volume of sand that could be 'won' from northern portion of Woolli Beach for nourishment. In order to provide a buffer against a 50-year ARI storm event, the CZMP identifies a volume 60,000m³ of sand would be required every five years for nourishment in front of Woolli Village. The Panel considers it is unlikely that such a volume would be able to be obtained from North Woolli or at such five year intervals, thus the effectiveness of the proposed BNS would be greatly reduced. The Panel is also uncertain about the utility the proposed BNS would provide in reducing the hazard risk to the Woolli Village.
- Note that due to the complexities of the issues surrounding the BNS and information in the CZMP which points to more recent recovery of sand volumes between 2010 and 2013 in front of Woolli Village, Council should seek to undertake a review of the present day coastal hazard threat, include more recent assessment of the condition of the beach in terms of changes in beach volume and position of MHWL over time. In this regard,

the Panel considers under the new Coastal Management Act this location might benefit from the CZMP being transitioned to a Coastal Management Program (CMP).

- Note that in the interim Council should be encouraged to undertake a one-off nourishment pilot with a volume of sand up to 20,000m³ sourced from North Wooli and used to nourish in front of Wooli Village, in order to develop an understanding of how this strategy performs and inform the development of any future CMP. Detailed monitoring of the source site and nourishment placement over several years should be coordinated with OEH. Council should be encouraged to apply for matched (50/50) funding from the State to undertake this action, which should be treated as an exceptional case.
- Note that a supplementary action of the CZMP is to undertake localised beach scraping adjacent to Wooli Village for the purposes of swale infill works and maintenance of formal beach access ways. Council is currently permitted and should be encouraged to continue to undertake these works in the absence of a certified CZMP.
- Encourage Council to continue to work closely with the Office of Environment and Heritage and DPI – Fisheries to work through any issues and obtain the necessary permits to enable Council to pilot the nourishment campaign.

Agenda Item 7 – Jetty Foreshores Project Coffs Harbour

On 29 November 2016 the Coastal Panel received correspondence from Coffs Harbour City Council (CHCC) notifying the Panel of its intention to undertake a jetty foreshores project at Coffs Harbour. This included the construction of a stepped seawall with concrete access ramp within the Coffs Harbour jetty foreshore area. This notification is pursuant to clause 129(2A)(b)(i) of the *State Environmental Planning Policy (Infrastructure) 2007*, requiring public authorities proposing new works on the open coast and where a coastal zone management plan is not in place, to notify the Coastal Panel before carrying out the development and take the panel's response into consideration.

Following a discussion and consideration of the matter, the Panel instructed MD to prepare a draft response to CHCC for circulation and finalisation by the Panel, encompassing the following elements:

- The documents and information relied upon to inform the Panel's advice to Council include:
 - (i) Review of Environmental Factors Jetty Foreshores Project (dated 11 November 2016);
 - (ii) Letter Report MHL2368 Coffs Harbour North-western Foreshore Stairs Physical Model Testing (dated 21 September 2015);
 - (iii) Jetty Foreshores: Market Area Upgrade Geotechnical Factual Investigation (dated October 2015);
 - (iv) Coffs Harbour Jetty4Shores Coastal Impacts Review Rev 00 (dated 15 December 2015);
 - (v) Structural Plans designed by de Groot & Benson supplied with the REF (dated 27 October 2016);
 - (vi) Structural Plans for Jetty Foreshores Stage 2-4 designed by CHCC supplied with the REF.
- The NSW Coastal Panel has reviewed the proposed Jetty Foreshores Project and has no major objections, but wishes to provide the following comments and recommendations for consideration:

- (i) The REF notes there will be a need to 'close the steps during stormy sea conditions coincident with high tides for the present day scenario'. Further consideration should be given around what oceanographic conditions this is likely to occur and a plan devised on how this would be managed.
- (ii) The REF notes there will be a need to manage the step/beach interface with maintenance in the form of sand replenishment following an erosion event around the seaward step edge. CHCC should seek to develop an understanding on the potential volume of sediment that may be required, the expected frequency and a plan devised on how this would be managed.
- (iii) Any design needs to consider the management of stormwater runoff likely to result from the plaza/amphitheatre areas, in order to limit the funnelling of stormwater towards the beach and scour of sand at the base of the stairs.
- (iv) No consideration has been given for relevant maintenance of the structure into the future under projected sea-level rise, although the potential risk for this area is noted on page 29 of the REF.
- (v) CHCC notes and updates the REF to address the considerations and recommendations received from DoI – Lands in the letter dated 15 December 2016.
- (vi) The NSW Coastal Panel notes information surrounding the structural design calculations of the stepped seawall, the pile analysis and design, nor the sheet piled seaward boundary wall has not been provided in the REF or accompanying documents, and have not been checked or verified by the Panel. CHCC is welcome to seek further advice from the Coastal Panel on such matters.

Agenda Item 8 – Estuary CZMP Package

MD advised that 6 Estuary CZMPs had been referred to the Panel regarding their suitability for certification under the Coastal Protection Act 1979. Plans were received for:

- Coastal Zone Management Plan for the Tomaga River Estuary
- Batemans Bay and Clyde River Estuary Management Plan
- Wagonga Inlet Estuary Management Study and Plan
- Moruya/ Deua River Estuary Management Plan
- Coastal Zone Management Plan for the Minnamurra River Estuary
- Coastal Zone Management Plan for the Crooked River Estuary

The Panel considered the OEH recommended position on each plan, which followed a detailed assessment against the legislative requirements of the Act and minimum requirements of the Guidelines for Preparing CZMPs.

OEH recommended plans for the Tomaga River Estuary, Minnamurra River Estuary and Crooked River to be **suitable for certification**. Plans for Batemans Bay and Clyde River Estuary, Wagonga Inlet Estuary and Moruya/Deua River were **not suitable for certification** and were recommended to be transitioned to a CMP.

Decision: The Panel agreed to endorse the OEH recommendations to the Minister.

Agenda Item 9 – Other Business

SW advised the Panel he would be leaving his role with DoI – Lands to take up a new position elsewhere. Regarding DoI – Lands representation on the Panel, SW advised he will

likely continue in his role as nominated DoI - Lands representative until such time as a new representative is appointed.

CD advised that all current Panel members' were being put forward in Cabinet for reappointment today.

Agenda Item 10 – Date for Next Meeting

No date was set down to the next meeting. The next meeting would be held as required. The meeting closed at 1:30pm.